



Australian Government  
Productivity Commission

# Regulation and its Review 2003-04

Productivity  
Commission  
*Annual Report Series*



© Commonwealth of Australia 2004

**ISBN 1 74037 161 5**

This work is subject to copyright. Apart from any use as permitted under the *Copyright Act 1968*, the work may be reproduced in whole or in part for study or training purposes, subject to the inclusion of an acknowledgment of the source. Reproduction for commercial use or sale requires prior written permission from the Department of Communications, IT and the Arts. Requests and inquiries concerning reproduction and rights should be addressed to the Commonwealth Copyright Administration, Intellectual Property Branch, Department of Communications, IT and the Arts, GPO Box 2154, Canberra ACT 2601.

*This publication is available in hard copy or PDF format from the Productivity Commission website at [www.pc.gov.au](http://www.pc.gov.au). If you require part or all of this publication in a different format, please contact Media and Publications (see below).*

**Publications Inquiries:**

Media and Publications  
Productivity Commission  
Locked Bag 2 Collins Street East  
Melbourne VIC 8003

Tel: (03) 9653 2244  
Fax: (03) 9653 2303  
Email: [maps@pc.gov.au](mailto:maps@pc.gov.au)

**General Inquiries:**

Tel: (03) 9653 2100 or (02) 6240 3200

**An appropriate citation for this paper is:**

Productivity Commission 2004, *Regulation and its Review 2003-04*, Annual Report Series, Productivity Commission, Canberra.

JEL code: D

**The Productivity Commission**

The Productivity Commission, an independent agency, is the Australian Government's principal review and advisory body on microeconomic policy and regulation. It conducts public inquiries and research into a broad range of economic and social issues affecting the welfare of Australians.

The Commission's independence is underpinned by an Act of Parliament. Its processes and outputs are open to public scrutiny and are driven by concern for the wellbeing of the community as a whole.

Information on the Productivity Commission, its publications and its current work program can be found on the World Wide Web at [www.pc.gov.au](http://www.pc.gov.au) or by contacting Media and Publications on (03) 9653 2244.

---

# Foreword

The Productivity Commission is required to report annually on regulation review and reform issues, including compliance by departments and agencies with the Australian Government's Regulation Impact Statement (RIS) requirements. The Commission also reports on the adequacy of RISs for regulatory proposals considered by Ministerial Councils and national standard-setting bodies, and on National Competition Policy reviews of Australian Government regulation. These processes are all designed to improve the quality of Australia's regulatory systems and enhance regulatory outcomes.

This is the seventh such report and forms part of the Productivity Commission's annual report series of publications for 2003-04. It draws on the work of the Office of Regulation Review, a separate unit within the Productivity Commission, which monitors and reports on compliance with the Government's RIS requirements and those of the Council of Australian Governments.

This edition of *Regulation and its Review* provides RIS compliance information in aggregate and for individual Australian Government departments and agencies, as well as for individual Ministerial Councils and national standard-setting bodies. The assessed adequacy of RISs for all Bills, disallowable instruments and treaties tabled in Parliament during the year is noted for the first time. This year's report also discusses the importance of effective consultation in generating high quality regulation and maintaining public confidence, and provides information on developments in regulatory policy in Australia and internationally.

The Commission is grateful for the cooperation of government departments and agencies, Ministerial Councils and national standard-setting bodies in providing information on their regulatory activities throughout the year.

Gary Banks  
Chairman

November 2004



---

# Contents

<b>Foreword</b>	<b>III</b>
<b>Contents</b>	<b>V</b>
<b>Key points</b>	<b>XII</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>XIII</b>
<b>1 The role of Regulation Impact Statements in improving regulation</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 Regulatory review and reform policy	2
1.2 International regulatory developments	3
1.3 Regulatory policy in Australia and the use of RISs	4
1.4 Why do some regulators find preparing RISs challenging?	8
1.5 Future directions in regulatory reform	9
<b>2 Compliance with RIS requirements</b>	<b>11</b>
2.1 Compliance with Australian Government requirements	11
2.2 Compliance by type of regulation	17
2.3 National regulation-making under COAG's requirements	22
<b>3 The importance of community consultation</b>	<b>25</b>
3.1 Why consult?	25
3.2 Features of effective consultation	26
3.3 Examples of consultation requirements	28
3.4 Lessons from experience	35
<b>A Compliance by portfolio</b>	<b>39</b>
<b>B Adequacy of published RISs</b>	<b>57</b>
<b>C COAG's RIS requirements — compliance and recent developments</b>	<b>69</b>
<b>D Australian Government legislation reviews</b>	<b>87</b>

---

<b>E</b>	<b>ORR activities and performance</b>	<b>91</b>
<b>F</b>	<b>Regulatory reform in States and Territories</b>	<b>101</b>
<b>G</b>	<b>International developments</b>	<b>117</b>
	<b>References</b>	<b>123</b>

## **BOXES**

1	Australian Government's RIS requirements	XV
1.1	Australian Government RIS processes	5
2.1	Adequacy criteria for RISs	12
2.2	Classifying the significance of proposals	14
3.1	Key features of effective consultation	27
3.2	UK Government's Code of Practice on Consultation	29
3.3	Consultation requirements in <i>A Guide to Regulation</i>	30
3.4	Consultation in the Disability Discrimination Act (DDA) inquiry	32
D.1	The template terms of reference	89
E.1	Charter of the Office of Regulation Review	91

## **FIGURES**

1	Compliance with RIS requirements at the decision-making stage, 2003-04	XVIII
2.1	RIS compliance, Bills, 1998-99 to 2003-04	19
2.2	RIS compliance, disallowable instruments, 1998-99 to 2003-04	20
2.3	RIS compliance, non-disallowable instruments and quasi-regulations, 1998-99 to 2003-04	21
A.1	Compliance with RIS requirements at the decision-making stage, 2003-04	40

## **TABLES**

1	RIS compliance, by type of regulation, 2003-04	XVI
2	Compliance by significance, 2003-04	XVII
2.1	RIS compliance, 1998-99 to 2003-04	13
2.2	Compliance by significance and timeliness, 2003-04	16

---

2.3	Compliance at the decision-making stage for proposals that restrict competition, 1999-2000 to 2003-04	17
2.4	RIS compliance, by type of regulation, 2003-04	18
2.5	COAG RIS compliance, regulatory decisions made by Ministerial Councils and national standard-setting bodies, 2000-01 to 2003-04	23
A.1	DAFF: RIS compliance by type of regulation, 2003-04	41
A.2	DCITA: RIS compliance by type of regulation, 2003-04	42
A.3	ACA: RIS compliance by type of regulation, 2003-04	43
A.4	DEH: RIS compliance by type of regulation, 2003-04	44
A.5	GBRMPA: RIS compliance by type of regulation, 2003-04	45
A.6	DHA: RIS compliance by type of regulation, 2003-04	47
A.7	DOTARS: RIS compliance by type of regulation, 2003-04	49
A.8	CASA: RIS compliance by type of regulation, 2003-04	50
A.9	Treasury (non-tax): RIS compliance by type of regulation, 2003-04	51
A.10	Treasury (tax): RIS compliance by type of regulation, 2003-04	52
A.11	APRA: RIS compliance by type of regulation, 2003-04	53
A.12	ASIC: RIS compliance by type of regulation, 2003-04	54
B.1	Bills, individual adequacy assessments	58
B.2	Disallowable instruments, individual adequacy assessments	62
B.3	Treaties, individual adequacy assessments	68
C.1	Cases where COAG RIS requirements were met	74
C.2	Cases of qualified compliance with the COAG RIS requirements	76
C.3	Cases where COAG RIS requirements were not met	77
C.4	COAG RIS compliance for regulatory decisions made by Ministerial Councils and NSSBs, 2000-01 to 2003-04	81
D.1	Reviews outstanding as at 30 June 2004	88
E.1	Australian Government regulatory and RIS activities, 1999-2000 to 2003-04	92
E.2	Australian Government RIS training evaluation: 2001-02 to 2003-04	95
F.1	RIS requirements in Australian jurisdictions	114
F.2	RIS processes in Australian jurisdictions	115
G.1	Application of RIA by selected EU member states, 2003	119

---

# Abbreviations

AASB	Australian Accounting Standards Board
ABA	Australian Broadcasting Authority
ABCB	Australian Building Codes Board
ACA	Australian Communications Authority
ACCC	Australian Competition and Consumer Commission
ACS	Australian Customs Service
ACT	Australian Capital Territory
A-G's	Attorney-General's Department
AFMA	Australian Fisheries Management Authority
AMSA	Australian Maritime Safety Authority
APRA	Australian Prudential Regulation Authority
AQIS	Australian Quarantine Inspection Service
ANZFRMC	Australia New Zealand Food Regulation Ministerial Council
APMVA	Australian Pesticides and Veterinary Medicines Authority
ASDA	Australian Sports Drug Agency
ASIC	Australian Securities and Investments Commission
ATC	Australian Transport Council
ATO	Australian Taxation Office
BCCS	Business Cost Compliance Statement (New Zealand)
BRRU	Business Regulation Reform Unit (Queensland)
CASA	Civil Aviation Safety Authority
CRR	Committee on Regulatory Reform
CRIS	Cost Recovery Impact Statement
COAG	Council of Australian Governments
DAFF	Department of Agriculture, Fisheries and Forestry

---

DCITA	Department of Communications, Information Technology and the Arts
DEWR	Department of Employment and Workplace Relations
DEH	Department of the Environment and Heritage
DFAT	Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade
DFCS	Department of Family and Community Services
DHA	Department of Health and Ageing
DITR	Department of Industry, Tourism and Resources
DOTARS	Department of Transport and Regional Services
DoFA	Department of Finance and Administration
EPHC	Environment Protection and Heritage Council
EU	European Union
ESD	ecologically sustainable development
GBRMPA	Great Barrier Reef Marine Park Authority
GM	genetically modified
IAC	Industries Assistance Commission
IC	Industry Commission
JSCOT	Joint Standing Committee on Treaties
MCCA	Ministerial Council on Consumer Affairs
NCA	National Capital Authority
NCC	National Competition Council
NCP	National Competition Policy
NOIE	National Office for the Information Economy
NOHSC	National Occupational Health and Safety Commission
NSSBs	National standard-setting bodies
NSW	New South Wales
NT	Northern Territory
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
ORR	Office of Regulation Review
PC	Productivity Commission

---

PIMC	Primary Industries Ministerial Council
PM&C	Department of the Prime Minister and Cabinet
Qld	Queensland
RBA	Reserve Bank of Australia
RIA	regulatory impact analysis
RIAU	Regulatory Impact Analysis Unit (New Zealand)
RIS	Regulation Impact Statement
RRU	Regulation Review Unit (Tasmania)
SA	South Australia
SARC	Scrutiny of Acts and Regulations Committee (Victoria)
SBC	Small Business Commissioner
SCAG	Standing Committee of Attorneys-General
SGG	synthetic greenhouse gases
SSCRO	Senate Standing Committee on Regulations and Ordinances (Australian Government)
Tas	Tasmania
UK	United Kingdom
US	United States of America
Vic	Victoria
WA	Western Australia