



Australian Government  
Productivity Commission

# Deep and Persistent Disadvantage in Australia

Productivity Commission  
Staff Working Paper

July 2013

*Rosalie McLachlan  
Geoff Gilfillan  
Jenny Gordon*

The views expressed in  
this paper are those of the  
staff involved and do not  
necessarily reflect the views of the  
Productivity Commission.

© Commonwealth of Australia 2013

ISBN 978-1-74037-445-3

This work is copyright. Apart from any use as permitted under the *Copyright Act 1968*, the work may be reproduced in whole or in part for study or training purposes, subject to the inclusion of an acknowledgment of the source. Reproduction for commercial use or sale requires prior written permission from the Productivity Commission. Requests and inquiries concerning reproduction and rights should be addressed to Media and Publications (see below).

*This publication is available from the Productivity Commission website at [www.pc.gov.au](http://www.pc.gov.au). If you require part or all of this publication in a different format, please contact Media and Publications.*

**Publications enquiries:**

Media and Publications  
Productivity Commission  
Locked Bag 2 Collins Street East  
Melbourne VIC 8003

Tel: (03) 9653 2244  
Fax: (03) 9653 2303  
Email: [maps@pc.gov.au](mailto:maps@pc.gov.au)

**General enquiries:**

Tel: (03) 9653 2100 or (02) 6240 3200

**An appropriate citation for this paper is:**

McLachlan, R., Gilfillan, G. and Gordon, J. 2013, *Deep and Persistent Disadvantage in Australia*, rev., Productivity Commission Staff Working Paper, Canberra.

***The Productivity Commission***

The Productivity Commission is the Australian Government's independent research and advisory body on a range of economic, social and environmental issues affecting the welfare of Australians. Its role, expressed most simply, is to help governments make better policies, in the long term interest of the Australian community.

The Commission's independence is underpinned by an Act of Parliament. Its processes and outputs are open to public scrutiny and are driven by concern for the wellbeing of the community as a whole.

Further information on the Productivity Commission can be obtained from the Commission's website ([www.pc.gov.au](http://www.pc.gov.au)) or by contacting Media and Publications on (03) 9653 2244 or email: [maps@pc.gov.au](mailto:maps@pc.gov.au)

---

# Contents

<b>Acknowledgments</b>	<b>viii</b>
<b>Abbreviations</b>	<b>ix</b>
<b>Key points</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>Overview</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>1 What is this paper about?</b>	<b>27</b>
1.1 Why the policy interest in disadvantage?	28
1.2 The paper structure	29
<b>2 What does it mean to be disadvantaged?</b>	<b>31</b>
2.1 Poverty — the traditional concept of disadvantage	32
2.2 Deprivation	38
2.3 Capability approach	42
2.4 Social exclusion and inclusion	46
2.5 Bringing together measures of income, deprivation, capabilities and social exclusion	51
2.6 The importance of dynamics in understanding disadvantage	54
<b>3 The extent of disadvantage in Australia</b>	<b>57</b>
3.1 Income based measures of disadvantage	58
3.2 Indicators of deprivation	69
3.3 Indicators of social exclusion	72
3.4 Characteristics of Australians most likely to experience disadvantage	82
3.5 Where do people experiencing disadvantage live?	86
3.6 The relative merits of the different measures of disadvantage	90
<b>4 Factors influencing life chances of experiencing disadvantage</b>	<b>93</b>
4.1 Early experiences and how they can influence life chances	98
4.2 Success at school — education and life chances	109

---

4.3	Beyond school	118
4.4	The importance of employment	126
4.5	Poor health, disability and disadvantage	136
4.6	Relationships and families	141
<b>5</b>	<b>The costs of disadvantage</b>	<b>147</b>
5.1	A broad framework for measuring avoidable costs	149
5.2	Forgone employment income	162
5.3	Expenditure on ‘regrettables’	172
5.4	Quality of life costs	175
5.5	The distribution of costs	183
<b>6</b>	<b>Where to from here? – measurement and data issues</b>	<b>187</b>
6.1	Issues underlying the different measures of disadvantage	188
6.2	Longitudinal data — critical for understanding disadvantage	190
6.3	Administrative data	196
<b>A</b>	<b>Characteristics of Australians most likely to experience disadvantage</b>	<b>203</b>
<b>B</b>	<b>Strengths and weaknesses of measures of disadvantage used in Australia</b>	<b>213</b>
	<b>References</b>	<b>217</b>
<b>Boxes</b>		
1	Measuring relative income poverty	5
2	Social exclusion/inclusion — some definitions	7
3	What is meant by marginal, deep, and very deep exclusion?	9
2.1	Equivalised household income	34
2.2	Henderson Poverty Line — an early Australian measure of relative poverty	35
2.3	Townsend’s summary deprivation index	39
2.4	Treasury’s wellbeing framework	46
2.5	Selected definitions of social exclusion	48
2.6	Some evidence on the relationship between income poverty and material deprivation	53

---

2.7	Short spells for most, but a small group experience persistent disadvantage	55
3.1	The main publicly available data sets used to measure persistent disadvantage	64
3.2	Components of the Social Exclusion Monitor (SEM)	75
3.3	Ability of SEM indicators to capture persistence of deep social exclusion	81
4.1	Establishing causality is not easy	94
4.2	Child abuse — evidence of long-term consequences	101
4.3	Preschool, school readiness and students' performance	104
4.4	Examples of early intervention programs	105
4.5	Poorer outcomes for children from low socioeconomic backgrounds continue through the school years	110
4.6	Some evidence on the effects of joblessness on children	114
4.7	Intergenerational transmission of income	125
4.8	Economic growth, living standards and job opportunities	127
4.9	Demand for unskilled workers has been falling	131
4.10	Some background facts about homelessness	133
4.11	Declining marriage and divorce rates	143
5.1	Is the total cost of disadvantage the right thing to measure?	148
5.2	Are expenditures that reduce disadvantage 'regrettables'?	155
5.3	The costs of childhood poverty: some examples	160
5.4	Some estimates of the effect of education on participation and wages	165
5.5	Some estimates of the effect of health on participation and wages	166
5.6	Hedonic adaptation and estimates of personal costs	176
5.7	Estimating the intrinsic impacts of disadvantage	179
6.1	Data integration projects	200

## Figures

1	Trends in income poverty and social exclusion, 2001 to 2010	11
2	Factors influencing life chances of experiencing disadvantage	14
3	The cycle of disadvantage can start early in life	16

---

4	Outcomes for Australian children aged 2-3 to 10-11 year olds by socioeconomic position	17
5	Highest educational attainment of Australians aged 30-44 years, by highest educational attainment of father	19
6	Steps in estimating the avoidable costs of disadvantage	22
7	One way of categorising the costs of disadvantage	22
2.1	Social inclusion conceptual framework — participation and resources	49
3.1	Trends in the proportion of Australians experiencing relative and absolute income poverty	62
3.2	Years in relative income poverty, 2001 to 2010	65
3.3	Trends in social exclusion: Social Exclusion Monitor, 2001 to 2010	76
3.4	Overlap between poverty, deprivation and exclusion, 2010	79
3.5	Persistence of social exclusion, 2001 to 2010	80
4.1	Factors influencing life chances of experiencing disadvantage	96
4.2	Distribution of risks among financially disadvantaged and non-financially disadvantaged families	107
4.3	The cycle of disadvantage can start early in life	108
4.4	Outcomes for Australian children aged 2-3 to 10-11 years by socioeconomic position	111
4.5	Labour force status by qualification, 2012	119
4.6	Deep social exclusion by education attainment	120
4.7	Average annual employee income of Australians of working age, 25-59 years, 2011-12	121
4.8	Highest educational attainment of Australians aged 30-44 years, by highest educational attainment of father	123
4.9	Proportion of homelessness by type, 2011	133
4.10	Lifecourse framework linking childhood disadvantage to poor adult health	137
4.11	Disability employment for people aged 15-64 years, 2009	140
5.1	Steps in estimating the avoidable costs of disadvantage	151
5.2	OECD's <i>How's Life?</i> Wellbeing Framework	152

5.3	One way of categorising the costs of disadvantage	157
5.4	Estimating the costs of disadvantage: employment income	163
5.5	Estimating the costs of disadvantage: quality of life	177

## Tables

1	Prevalence of forms of disadvantage for vulnerable groups, 2010	12
2.1	Equivalence scales and corresponding elasticities	34
3.1	Estimates of relative income poverty in Australia	59
3.2	Two-year income poverty status	67
3.3	Different estimates for financial poverty, 2007	68
3.4	Items regarded as essential, who has them, and who does not have them because they cannot afford them, 2006	70
3.5	Prevalence of multiple deprivation, 2006 and 2010	72
3.6	Degree of overlap between income poverty, deprivation and social exclusion	78
3.7	Rates of transition between states of exclusion	82
3.8	Prevalence of forms of disadvantage for vulnerable groups	83
3.9	Distribution of residents in bottom quintile of distribution of relative socioeconomic disadvantage, 2006	89
4.1	Average development scores by child characteristics, age 4-5	106
4.2	Son's earnings compared with father's earnings	125
4.3	Intergenerational mobility across the earnings distribution	125
4.4	Years in jobless/job-poor household, 2001 to 2009	129
4.5	Journeys home respondents – labour force status and incidence of mental health	134
A.1	Prevalence and composition of relative income poverty, 2009-10	204
A.2	Profile of deprivation and poverty	205
A.3	Prevalence of depth of social exclusion	207
A.4	Years in relative income poverty by household type, 2001 to 2010	209
A.5	Characteristics of those deeply and persistently excluded	211
B.1	Characteristics of different measures of disadvantage	215

---

# Acknowledgments

The authors wish to thank the following people for their help and advice in the production of the paper: Peter Whiteford (ANU), Sue Richardson (Flinders University), Francisco Azpitarte (Brotherhood of St Laurence and Melbourne Institute), Roger Wilkins and Rosanna Scutella (Melbourne Institute), Peter Saunders and Melissa Wong (SPRC), John Landt (Prime Minister and Cabinet), Mike Woods, Alison McClelland, Les Andrews, Frank Nugent, Dominique Lowe, Jared Greenville, Lisa Gropp and Alan Johnston (Productivity Commission).

The views in this paper remain those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Productivity Commission or of the external organisations and people who provided assistance.



---

# Abbreviations

ABS	Australian Bureau of Statistics
AEDI	Australian Early Development Index
AIHW	Australian Institute of Health and Welfare
ANU	Australian National University
CUPSE	Community Understanding of Parenting and Social Exclusion
DEEWR	Department of Education, Employment and Workplace Relations
DHS	Department of Human Services
DIAC	Department of Immigration and Citizenship
EU	European Union
FaHCSIA	Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
HILDA	Household Income and Labour Dynamics in Australia
IAC	Industries Assistance Commission
IC	Industry Commission
LSAC	Longitudinal Study of Australian Children
LSAY	Longitudinal Surveys of Australian Youth
NATSEM	National Centre for Social and Economic Modelling
NESB	Non-English Speaking Background
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
PC	Productivity Commission
PEMA	Poverty and Exclusion in Modern Australia
PISA	Programme of International Student Assessment
RED	Research Evaluation Database
SEIFA	Socio-Economic Index for Areas
SEM	Social Exclusion Monitor
SLA	Statistical Local Areas
SLCD	Statistical Longitudinal Census Dataset
SPRC	Social Policy Research Centre