Next intelligence failure 300 billion barrels OPEC oil missing

Reserve history (Gb)



BP's end 2003 reserves: 1147 Gb



Opec's spurious reserve additions in the 1980s now a serious issue

as the world starts to look for its remaining oil reserves

Updated: includes WEO 2004

Prepared by: Matt Mushalik

December 2004

mushalik@tpg.com.au

List of Contents

Торіс	Year	Page					
Introduction & Summary		3					
BP's data source and footnote in spreadsheet							
Colin Campbell's presentation to the House of Commons All-Party	1999	3					
Committee							
Matthew Simmons' work on giant oil fields	2001	3					
CSIS conference with Aramco presentation	2/2004	4					
Article in the Oil & Gas Journal by Dr S. Al-Husseini in 5/2004	5/2004	4					
ASPO's interpretation of Saudi Reserves in 6/2004	6/2004	4					
IEA's workshop in Rio	7/2004	4					
Article in Petroleum Review by Salameh about OPEC's reserves	8/2004	5					
"This Middle East Energy Belief is an Illusion", presentation by M.	9/2004	5					
Simmons in the Hudson Institute, Washington							
PFC Energy's oil supply forecast	9/2004	5					
Editor of Petroleum Review on PFC's reserves	10/2004	6					
IEA's World Energy Outlook 2004 on OPEC reserves	10/2004	6					
Federal Government's energy white paper silent on OPEC reserve issue	6/2004	6					

Appendices:

2 Graph from the Association for the Study of Peak Oil & Gas (ASPO) showing computer modeled future oil production based on technical data, in which OPEC's spurious reserve additions have already been deducted.

- 10.1 "Future of Global Oil Supply: Saudi Arabia"; Conference at the Center for Strategic and International Studies, Washington, Feb. 2004
- 10.2 Workshop presentation in Rio de Janeiro in July 2004 entitled "Is The World Facing a 3rd Oil Shock?" by K.Rehaag, editor of the IEA's monthly Oil Market Report
- 10.3 Opec's reserve additions in the 1980's
- 10.4 Twilight in the Desert: The Fading of Saudi Arabia's Oil Summary from a presentation by Simmons & Company Intl. in 9/2004
- 10.5 "Global Crude Oil and Natural Gas Liquids Supply Forecast"; Center for Strategic and International Studies, by PFC Energy, Sep 2004
- 10.6 Revision of OPEC reserves; As calculated by Chris Skrebowski, editor of Petroleum Review, Oct 2004
- 10.7 Transition from growth to decline
- 10.8 Saudi Arabia's Oil Reserves and Production
- 12 Current oil supply situation
- 16 IEA's World Energy Outlook 2004 (Table 3.5)

Introduction

The UK Government has recently asked for more "transparency" in relation to OPEC's top secret remaining oil reserves. In plain English: the world is flying blind. Prof. Goodstein from California reminded us in Tony Jones' ABC TV Lateline programme on 22/11/2004 that not only Shell and other companies had to reclassify their reserves downwards but that countries, who own 90% of the oil, have also overstated their reserves. Matthew Simmons, a former participant in Dick Cheney's 2001 Energy Task Force demands immediate 3rd party inspections of OPEC oil fields and related records, which would reveal the magnitude and the proximity of the problem.

Summary

According to a series of oil depletion reports and articles published in the course of 2004, 300 billion + barrels of OPEC oil reserves seem to be missing out of a world total of 1147 bn barrels (BP's Statistical Review of World Energy 2004). There is mounting evidence that some **OPEC countries are reporting total oil reserves ever discovered, including past production, instead of remaining reserves**.

Therefore, BP's quoted future reserves contain oil already consumed. If this turns out to be the case, the world is facing an oil crisis the consequences of which we have not understood yet.

BP relies on oil reserve reports from many governments

BP collects data from various oil producing countries without validating them. It therefore relies on the truthfulness of reserve data reported e.g. by governments. A fine print at the bottom of BP's proved reserve table adds an important, but often overseen qualification: "The estimates in this table have been compiled using a combination of primary official sources, third party data from the OPEC Secretariat, World Oil, Oil & Gas Journal, and an independent estimate of Russian reserves based on information in the public domain. The reserves figures shown do not necessarily meet the United States Securities and Exchange Commission definitions and guidelines for determining proved reserves nor necessarily represent BP's view of proved reserves by country. The figure for Canadian oil reserves includes an official estimate of Canadian oil sands 'under active development'. Oil includes gas condensate and natural gas liquids as well as crude oil."

Facts of OPEC's spurious reserve additions known since 1999

The problem with the accuracy of OPEC reserve data is known for some time and was first addressed by Colin J. Campbell, a retired oil geologist from Ireland and founder of ASPO (Association for the Study of Peak Oil & Gas), during a presentation to a House of Commons All-Party Committee in 1999¹) (when UK oil production peaked) and then continued to be debated in the following annual conferences of ASPO.

2001: Dick Cheney's Energy Task Force uncovered problems with Saudi oil fields

More detailed work on one of OPEC's members, Saudi Arabia, was done by the American investment banker and former advisor to Dick Cheney's 2001 Energy Task Force, Matthew

Simmons. He studied all giant oil fields world wide and found that daily world production depended surprisingly high on large, maturing fields and that newly discovered giants have been progressively smaller²). During this work, Simmons became suspicious about the true status of oil reserves in Saudi fields.

Feb 2004: Aramco's answers to challenging questions unsatisfactory

The Center for Strategic and International Studies in Washington then invited Matthew Simmons³⁾ and Saudi Aramco oil officials to a conference in February 2004 to discuss this issue. Aramco repeated earlier claims it could supply 10 million barrels of oil for the next 50 years but did not provide detailed, field-by-field reserves and past and projected future production data. In Aramco's presentation⁴⁾, one slide revealed that Ghawar, the world's largest, super giant oil field (5 million barrels daily production, 6% of the global oil supply) is now 48% depleted and therefore shortly before its peak. **This information alone should be alarming.** The average depletion level of all Saudi fields was given as 28% but a later study (see below) by PFC Energy, Washington, found this to be rather 42%. At an annual depletion rate of 1% pa this would be equivalent to turning Saudi Arabia's oil depletion clock forwards by 14 years! The question of the validity of Saudi reserves remained unresolved (see Appendix 10.1)

May 2004: An article in the Oil & Gas Journal by Dr S. Al-Husseini adds more confusion to the Saudi reserve definition debate

The article¹⁰⁾ starts by reiterating that "as of 2004, Saudi Aramco has established its oil reserves at 260 bn barrels" but later refers to it as a "reserve base". Out of this, 130 Gb are "remaining proven developed reserves" and 130 Gb are "discovered but undeveloped Saudi reservoirs". Prof Aleklett from Uppsala University in Sweden comments: "Reserves base is not proven reserves according to SEC, the Securities and Exchange Commission. That's the reason why Shell has to downgrade its reserves". (see Appendix 10.8)

June 2004: ASPO comments on Saudi reserves of 260 Gb

In its June 2004 Newsletter¹¹, ASPO notes that "undeveloped reserves are evidently a good deal less than proved" and that these reserves may refer to "unconfirmed new discoveries with extreme assumed recovery factors, or even oil-in-place". ASPO's current assessment is that "97 Gb have been produced so far; that 144 Gb will come from known fields and 18 Gb from new discovery, giving a total of 260 Gb, the number claimed as remaining reserves. The article presents little evidence to counter ASPO's current forecast that production will be flat to at least the midpoint of depletion in 2013. The depletion rate at that point would be about 2.3%, which is still relatively low, meaning that plateau production could be extended for some years longer before terminal decline need set in." (see Appendix 10.8)

Jul 2004: IEA (International Energy Agency in Paris) addresses oil depletion issues, the 1st time after many Energy Outlooks ignored the issue

In July 2004, in a FVG and IBP workshop in Rio de Janeiro the editor of the monthly Oil Market Report, K. Rehaag from the International Energy Agency, presented a slide show asking the question "Is the World Facing a 3rd Oil Shock?"⁵⁾ and notes that global reserves are

overstated for political reasons. A huge "challenge" lies ahead to find incremental barrels to offset depletion in 70% of oil fields. The IEA is not usually known for pessimistic outlooks. (see Appendix 10.2)

August 2004: Petroleum Review calculates 300 bn barrels OPEC oil overstated

In the August 2004 issue of the Petroleum Review⁶⁾ (page 26-28) Dr M.G. Salameh, a consultant to the World Bank and UNIDO, <u>finds that around 300 bn barrels of OPEC oil</u> <u>have been overstated</u> as a result of OPEC's internal quota war in the 1980s. His article is supported by calculations from Prof. Kenneth S. Deffeyes of Princeton University. Dr. Salameh concludes:

"The current global reserves/production (R/P) ratio is 37 years based on global proven reserves of 1047.7 bn barrels (at the beginning of 2003) and an annual production of 28 bn barrels. A downward revision of OPEC reserves by 300 bn barrels will reduce the R/P ratio by 10 years to 27..... However, whether the figure is 37 or 27 years, one has to realise that oil production will not stay flat during that period and then suddenly drop to zero. <u>Rather, it will</u> rise to peak after which mankind is faced with an era of declining production. Thus it is clear that 'peak production' will be an important turning point in our future reliance on oil and, therefore, <u>consumers and governments alike should be made aware how close such a</u> <u>date might be.</u>" (underline added by author)

A simple R/P calculation is oil-geologically irrelevant

It is important to note that a simple, even revised R/P calculation 750/28=27 years is grossly misleading and unrealistic because one cannot just distribute remaining oil reserves freely over any period of time. The future production of oil is determined by a complex set of parameters including economic, financial, geo-political, technological and, <u>above all, oil-geological factors</u> and must be computer modeled, field by field, using technical reserve and historic production data. The flow of oil in source rock is controlled by the laws of fluid mechanics. Advanced technology can speed up the flow of oil to a certain extent but cannot change the oil geological characteristics of each field in principle, especially not after peak oil. Therefore, future production profiles cannot be forced, by wishful thinking, into any flat or even ever growing demand curves. (see Appendix 10.3)

Sep 2004: Continuing worries about Saudi oil fields

In September 2004, Matthew Simmons sums up his latest findings at the Hudson Institute, Washington⁷⁾ and presents slides entitled "This Middle East Energy Belief is an Illusion" and "Why I worry about Saudi Arabia's Oil" with an outlook on water injection and future tertiary recovery techniques in maturing Saudi fields. (see Appendix 10.4)

Sep 2004: PFC Energy study in Washington finds OPEC's oil is depleting

Also in September 2004, the Center for Strategic and International Studies in Washington published a report from PFC Energy "Global crude oil and natural gas liquids supply forecast"⁸⁾ highlighting i.a. the depletion rates of various OPEC countries (e.g. Saudi Arabia: 42%; Nigeria 50%; Iran: 50%; Qatar: 62%; Venezuela: 58%) which suggests that these countries are in a phase of transition from growth to decline. In the case of Saudi Arabia, this is of great concern (see Appendix 10.5)

Oct 2004: Analysis of PFC Energy report confirms OPEC reserves only 506 bn barrels, not 882 bn barrels

In the October newsletter of ASPO⁹⁾, Chris Skrebowski, editor of UK Petroleum Review, analysed PFC Energy's data and writes: <u>"The immediate conclusions are that OPEC with</u> the exception of Indonesia, Algeria, Libya and just possibly Nigeria are supplying BP with their total discovered rather than their remaining reserves." The 'total discovered reserves' include oil which has already been produced and consumed. The PFC Energy report implies that BP's reported OPEC reserves of 882 bn are in fact only 506 bn, a massive reduction (see Appendix 10.6)

Oct 2004: The International Energy Agency confirms overstated OPEC reserves

The IEA released its latest World Energy Outlook end of October 2004, in which one can find following paragraph:

"According to BP, reserves increased dramatically in the 1980s and 1990s, from 670 billions barrels at the end of 1960 to 1147 billion barrels at the end of 2003. But most of the increase occurred in OPEC countries, mainly in the Middle East, in the second half of the 1980s. Saudi Arabia and Kuwait revised their reserves upward by 50%, while Venezuelan reserves were boosted 57% by the inclusion of heavy oil in 1988. The United Arab Emirates and Iraq also recorded large upward revisions in that period. Total OPEC reserves jumped from 538 billion barrels in 1985 to 766 billion barrels in 1990. As a result, world oil reserves increased by more that 30%. This hike in OPEC countries' estimates of their reserves was driven by negotiations at that time over production quotas, and had little to do with the actual discovery of new reserves. In fact, very little exploration activity was carried out in those countries at that time. Total reserves have hardly changed since the end of the 1980s."

Strangely enough however, this acknowledgement does not seem to have entered IEA's figure 3.20 in WEO 2004 (see Appendix 16) which is based on the USGS 2000 mean estimate and contains the uncorrected OPEC reserves. Therefore, the USGS mean estimate would have to be reduced accordingly, including its 44% reserve growth addition. (See Appendix 16 page 4 and reference #12 for details)

The IEA has put Governments on notice that peak oil may come before 2015 if the USGS 2000 mean estimate should prove too high.

Australia's energy white paper has got it all wrong

The Federal Government's energy white paper "Securing Australia's Energy Future" is based on the assumption there are world reserves of 1050 bn barrels of oil and that these are sufficient to supply world demand for around 40 years. **One must now ask why were these absolutely vital oil reserve data not independently checked and confirmed by the Government?**

The energy white paper, in which these assumptions are made, is already flawed in principle even with its currently quoted figures. It contains 3 mutually exclusive statements:

- 1. global oil reserves of 1050 bn barrels (page 119, quoted from BP 2003)
- 2. increasing daily oil production to 104 million barrels in 2020 (page 120, quoted from IEA 2002)

3. "sufficient reserves to supply world demand for around 40 years" (page 119, Government's own thinking)



Let us put this into a graph and check the arithmetic:

Statements 1 AND 2 AND 3 are mutually exclusive as the above graph shows. If production increased up to 104 mbd in 2020, already around 600 bn barrels would be produced by 2020, leaving just 450 bn for the remaining period of 22 years which would require a 6% annual decline in order not to exceed the total reserves of 1050 bn. And this simple calculation assumes that the initial increase would be geologically feasible.

Statement (3) should actually read "There are global oil reserves equal to 40 years of current world consumption", which is completely different. The functional dependency between production and reserves, largely controlled by oil-geology, is non linear. Production over time always follows a bell shape type of curve (Hubbert's curve) with decreasing production after the peak. Therefore, it may take up to 70 years or more until 1050 barrels can be physically produced.

Together with serious doubts now hanging over the 1050 bn barrels reserve figure itself, <u>the</u> <u>Federal Government's notion of sufficient oil supplies for 40 years is absolutely</u> <u>untenable</u>. The energy white paper in its current version will lead to a huge mis-allocation of funds for new transport infrastructure (overshooting) and a continuing inactivity in relation to the development of alternative transportation fuels. <u>The energy white paper should</u> <u>therefore be withdrawn from circulation or ignored</u>.

Read about how quickly oil production growth can turn into decline in Appendix 10.7 and a summary of the world's current oil supply situation in Appendix 12

New Transport Policy absolutely urgent

The above has huge repercussions on the transport-, road-, rail- and airport infrastructure policy, on urban development strategies and the agricultural sector all of which have to take into account the approaching peak of oil production and its decline thereafter.

Prepared by

Matt Mushalik (Civ. Eng. MIEAust), Epping 2121, mushalik@tpg.com.au

References:

1) Presentation to a House of Commons All-Party Committee in 1999 by C.J. Campbell http://www.hubbertpeak.com/campbell/commons.htm

2) Matthew Simmons; The World's Giant Oilfields, Hubbert Center Newsletter 2002/1 http://hubbert.mines.edu/news/Simmons_02-1.pdf.

3) CSIS conference in Feb 2004; Matthew Simmons' slide show "The Saudian Oil Miracle" <u>www.csis.org/energy/040224_simmons.pdf</u>

4) CSIS conference in Feb 2004; Abdul Baqi and Nansen Saleri's slide show: "50 year crude oil supply scenario, Saudi Aramco's perspective" <u>www.csis.org/energy/0404224_baqiandsaleni.pdf</u>

5) FVG and IBP Workshop in Rio; slide show by K. Rehaag (International Energy Agency) "Is the world facing a 3rd oil shock?" www.iea.org/dbtw-wpd/Textbase/speech/2004/kr_rio.pdf

6) Petroleum Review August 2004, page 26-29; article from Dr. Salameh "How realistic are Opec's proven oil reserves?" www.odac-info.org/welcome/documents/SALAMEH-PETREVIEW.pdf

7) Slide show by Matthew Simmons at the Hudson Institute: "Twilight in the desert; The Fading of Saudi Arabia's Oil" http://www.simmonsco-intl.com/files/Hudson%20Institute%20September.pdf

8) PFC Energy's report dated September 2004: "Global crude oil and natural gas liquids supply forecast"

www.csis.org/energy/040908_presentation.pdf

9) ASPO Newsletter October 2004, item 430 by Chris Skrebowski: "A remarkable presentation by Washington" <u>http://www.asponews.org/docs/newsletter46.pdf</u>

10) Article in the Oil & Gas Journal, May 2004, by Dr. S. Al-Husseini "Saudi Arabia's Oil Reserves"; also available at the web site of the Saudi-American Forum http://ogi.pennnet.com/Articles/Article_Display.cfm?Section=Articles&ARTICLE_ID=204659

11) ASPO Newsletter June 2004, item 365 "Saudi Reserves – a false alarm and a confession" <u>http://www.asponews.org/docs/newsletter42.pdf</u>

12) "International Energy Agency accepts Peak Oil", analysis of chapter 3 of the WEO 2004 by Prof. Aleklett, Hydrocarbon Depletion Study Group, Uppsala University, Sweden www.peakoil.net

Latest update: 27/1/2005



ASPO's annual oil production simulated on the basis of technical reserve and production data. Half of the regular oil is already consumed. Though higher oil prices will result in exploration and production from new fields (+135 Gb) future production is limited by oil geology. Peak oil will trigger a general energy crisis as the world will seek to fill the gap. Our economy and transport systems will have to adapt. Prudent governance requires that we change our current energy & transport policies NOW before the crisis manifests itself.

		ESTIMAT	ED PR	DUCTION TO 2100					End 2004	
	Amount		Gb	Annua	Annual Rate - Regular Oil					Peak
	Regul	ar Oil	Mb/d	2005	2010	2020	2050	Total	Date	
Past	Fu	ture	Total	US-48	3.4	2.7	1.7	0.4	200	1972
Known	Fields	New		Europe	5.2	3.6	1.8	0.3	75	2000
945	760	145	1850	Russia	9.1	8	5.4	1.5	220	1987
	9	05		ME Gulf	20	20	20	12	680	1974
	All Lic	quids		Other	28	25	17	8	675	2004
1040	1040 1360 2400		World	66	59	46	22	1850	2006	
2004 Base Scenario				An	nual R	ate - O	ther			
M.East producing at capacity				Heavy etc.	2.4	4	5	4	160	2021
(anomalous reporting corrected)				Deepwater	4.8	7	6	0	70	2014
Regular Oil excludes oil from				Polar	0.9	1	2	0	52	2030
coal, shale, bitumen, heavy,			Gas Liquid	8.0	9	10	8	275	2027	
deepwater, polar & gasfield NGL			Roundi	ng	0	2		-7		
Revised 26/01/2005			ALL	82	80	70	35	2400	2007	



Peak production follows peak discovery (in the mid 1960s) with a time lag.

Source of graphs: Association for the Study of Peak Oil & Gas, at <u>www.asponews.org</u> *Compiled by C.J.Campbell, Staball Hill, Ballydehob, Co. Cork, Ireland* Last Update: 3/2/2005

Appendix 10.1: "Future of Global Oil Supply: Saudi Arabia" Conference at the Center for Strategic and International Studies, Washington, Feb. 2004

Matthew Simmons, an American investment banker (http://www.simmonsco-intl.com/), who participated in Dick Cheney's Energy task force in 2001, had done a study on the world's giant oilfields, many of which are now mature. He came across 200 Saudi technical papers which seemed to indicate problems associated with advanced depletion in certain fields. Reflecting worries about these findings, some critical questions on depletion levels in Saudi fields were put before Aramco officials attending the conference:



Source: http://www.csis.org/energy/0404224_simmons.pdf

In reply, Saudi Aramco's officials repeated the usual assurance of 50 years of oil supplies at 10-12 million barrels per day, but one slide revealed that the super giant oil field Ghawar (5 mbpd) is 48% depleted. This alone would be of concern as peak normally occurs at the mid point. Massive injection of highly corrosive salt water is needed to support reservoir pressure. The oil coming from horizontal multiple head wells, indicating advanced recovery techniques to maintain production, contains already 36% water. A slide was shown with an average depletion level for all Saudi fields of 28%, but PFC Energy (Washington) later calculated this to be rather 42%. At a depletion rate of 1% pa this would be equivalent to advancing Saudi Arabia's depletion clock by 14 years!



Appendix 10.2: Is The World Facing a 3rd Oil Shock?

This was the question asked by K.Rehaag, editor of the IEA's monthly Oil Market Report, during a workshop presentation in Rio de Janeiro in July 2004.



Source of graphs and content: <u>www.iea.org/dbtw-wpd/Textbase/speech/2004/kr_rio.pdf</u> (colors reversed)

In the 1980s, reserves quoted by BP (as reported by Governments) experienced an unusual increase (graph below). This long known fact attracts interest and analysis now as the world starts to look for where the remaining oil is. The UK Government asked for more transparency in OPEC reserve data. In plain English: the world is flying blind as far as OPEC oil reserves are concerned. In Petroleum Review¹⁾, August 2004, Dr. M.G. Salameh, a consultant to the World Bank and UNIDO, tries to shed light on this question



Reserve history in 6 OPEC countries: sudden jump of reported reserves between 1982 and 1988 by 293 bn barrels equivalent to 5 times the initial North Sea reserves. Source: BP Statistical Review World Energy 2004

by calculating that OPEC's reserves at the beginning of 2003 should be <u>520 bn rather</u> than 820 bn barrels, based on the following observations:

- there were no exploration or drilling efforts during that period which would have justified the size of the additions
- these are political reserves designed to position each country favourably under quota rules introduced in the early 80s which also included reserves
- upward revisions of earlier, conservative estimates of oil in place done by oil companies before nationalization were exaggerated
- the recovery rate applied to the oil in place was increased from 20% to 50% while the world average is rather in the order of 30%
- the reserves could result from the mixture of all of the above

Prof. Kenneth S. Deffeyes from Princeton University comes to similar conclusions



Middle East's implausible reserve history compared only slightly to an increasing reserve curve for the rest of the world caused by rather modest revisions and additions from small new fields (in bn barrels of oil). Another North Sea sized reserve was added in 2004 to smaller ME reserves already published in 2003.

1) www.odac-info.org/welcome/documents/SALAMEH-PETREVIEW.pdf

Appendix 10.4: Twilight in the Desert: The Fading of Saudi Arabia's Oil Summary from a presentation by Simmons & Company Intl. in 9/2004

Conventional Wisdom	Reality
All long term oil supply/demand	7 key fields produce 90% + of Saudi oil; average
models assume ME oil can grow as	life is 45-50 years
fast as demand rises	
Middle East oil will also be cheap	When water injection/drive ends, costs become
	very high
If more oil is needed, drill anywhere	Middle East oil is in the golden triangle; few
	giant oil fields were found after the mid 1960s
Energy planner's assumption: Saudi	No solid data on any aspect of Saudi oil.
Arabia can produce 10-25 mb/day	Analysis of 200 technical papers is troubling
Many discovered but yet to be pro-	New projects are merely offsetting declining
duced fields are waiting in the wings	production in mature fields
There are large unexplored areas with	Unexplored areas are: Iraq's southern border,
plenty of oil	deepwater Red Sea, bottom end of empty quarter



Saudi oil is shrouded in secrecy Key secrets: How much oil is produced? How many proven reserves are really proven? What is the average well productivity? How much spare capacity really exists? What are the production volumes of each field? What will the decline by field be? Will the crystal ball help?

Field m	1b/day(1994)	Problems	Fazran 🛜	
Ghawar	5,000,000	55%-65% of Saudi oil	'Ain Dar	Shedrum
		produced between 1951 and		Uneugum
		2004. Water cut is 33%.		and the second
Safaniya	960,000	Is losing water aquifer	Однатанар	Ommaniyan
Abqaiq	650,000	Down from 1 mill in 1973;		
		pockets of by-passed oil		
Berri	400,000	Down from a 1977 peak of		nawiyan
		790,000. Future gas field.		
Zuluf	500,000	Is losing water aquifer	markale V	
Marjan	400,000	Is losing water aquifer	Har	adh
Abu	150,000	Will use massive numbers		
Sa'fah	Ghay	war SP		
Total	8,060,000	(9,600,00 in 2003)		

Saudi oil fields depletion stages



Aggressive use of water management has kept prime reservoir pressures high, which led to extremely high flow rates. In the late 1990s vertical production wells watered up fast and are now obsolete. Well productivity has been steadily declining.

Ghawar

Extended reach horizontal wells, maximum reservoir contact wells and intelligent wells with automatic water shut off valves are finishing the secondary sweep

Artificial lift/tertiary recovery can extract more oil but many more wells are needed, most fluid produced will be water, not oil. Future fields like Khurais are more challenging.

>>>When Ghawar's oil output declines, Saudi's oil will have peaked

Source: http://www.simmonsco-intl.com/files/Hudson%20Institute%20September.pdf

Appendix 10.5: "Global Crude Oil and Natural Gas Liquids Supply Forecast" Center for Strategic and International Studies, by PFC Energy, Sep 2004

The graph below shows Non-OPEC countries in decline or on a plateau; the number of countries passing from peak to decline is accelerating





Global Non-OPEC Total Liquids with New Exploration A rather optimistic estimate in relation to FSU oil and tar sands in Canada which require huge amounts of gas for processing. It will also require substantial success in exploration efforts which is by no means guaranteed. Note that compared to ASPO, PFC's peak moves down only a couple of years from 2007 to 2012. No big difference in principle for the usual Cost Benefit Analysis covering a period of 25 years.

Annual Crude Production Balance

(Excluding OPEC, FSU, NGLs and Canada)

The world is consuming more than we are discovering for a long period of time now. We clearly draw down our reserves.





In Sep 2004, the Center for Strategic and International Studies, Washington, published a report from PFC Energy entitled "Global crude oil and natural gas liquids supply forecast" listing many countries with their respective oil depletion levels. Chris Skrebowski, editor of Petroleum Review, has analysed these lists and compiled following table (1Gb = 1 billion barrels) by combining information from 3 other sources, namely:

- 1. Association for the Study of Peak Oil & Gas <u>http://www.peakoil.net/</u>
- 2. Dr. Salameh, consultant to the World Bank and UNIDO, article in Petroleum Review 8/2004 "How realistic are OPEC's proven oil reserves?" www.odac-info.org/welcome/documents/SALAMEH-PETREVIEW.pdf
- 3. BP Statistical Review World Energy 2004 (end 2003) http://www.bp.com/

1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
OPEC	Cum Prod	%	Indicated	F	Remaining l	Reserves Gb		BP Estimates
	End 2003	Depleted	Total	PFC	ASPO	Salameh	BP	Interpreted
Iraq	28	22%	127	99	62	62	115	Total Discovered
UAE	19	31%	61	42	49	37	98	Total Discovered
Kuwait	32	35%	91	59	60	71	97	Total Discovered
Libya	23	39%	59	36	29	26	36	
Saudi	97	42%	231	134	144	182	263	Total Discovered
Algeria	13	50%	26	13	14	11	11	
Nigeria	23	50%	46	23	25	20	34	? High Estimate
Iran	56	51%	110	54	60	64	131	Total Discovered
Venezuela	47	58%	81	34	35	31	78	Total Discovered
Qatar	6.8	62%	11	4.2	4.1	4.6	15	Total Discovered
Indonesia	20	75%	27	6.7	9.4	12	4.4	
TOTAL	365		870	506	492	520	882	
NON-OPEC								
China	30	61%	49	19	24		24	
Mexico	31	48%	65	22	22		16	
Brunei	3.1	58%	5.3	1.2	1.2		1.1	
Malaysia	5.6	61%	9.2	4.0	4.0		4.0	
Denmark	1.5	61%	2.5	1.0	1.0		1.3	
India	5.8	66%	8.8	4.9	4.9		5.6	

Source: http://www.asponews.org/docs/newsletter46.pdf

Col 2: Cumulative production in Gb to the end of 2003 from	Col 6: ASPO's remaining reserves
ASPO	
Col 3: depletion levels from the PFC study	Col 7: Salameh's remaining reserves
Col 4: PFC's total reserve assumption (Col 2 divided by Col 3)	Col 8: BP's remaining reserves
Col 5: PFC's remaining reserves (Col 4 minus Col 2)	

The difference between PFC's assumed remaining reserves and those published by BP is huge. Skrebowski comes to the following conclusions:

- (1) "OPEC with the exception of Indonesia, Algeria, Libya and just possibly Nigeria are supplying BP with their total discovered rather than their remaining reserves"
- (2) "OPEC's reserves are around the 500 Gb mark, or 300-400 Gb short of what is generally assumed"
- (3) In addition to 18 countries which were already identified (in Petroleum Review 8/2004 page 42) having declining production, more countries like Qatar, Iran and Algeria will join this group. The most worrying news, however, is that Saudi Arabia is approaching a plateau

The 18 countries in decline produced 22 mb/d in 2003, the next group of countries, now on a plateau, to approach the phase of decline produced 28 mb/d. Once this happens, 50 mb/d will be in decline which cannot be offset any longer by increasing production elsewhere. Skrebowski, taking into account current new mega projects, writes: **"I'll be surprised if we make it to 2008 before the inexorable production decline begins"** Latest update: 11/11/04

In the coming years, more and more countries are joining a growing group of countries with declining oil production. In 2003, with a daily production of 22 mill barrels per day, their world market share had already reached 29% of the total of 77 mb/d.





-4.0%

There are 2 peaks here with the derivative crossing the 0% line twice into the negative decline area.

The superimposition of several production curves from different countries in various stages of depletion will always result in a bumpy plateau around the peak.

Very important are the decline rates after the peak. They seem to accelerate into the 4% area just 2-3 years after the peak. Whether our economy and transport system can adapt will depend on whether a critical decline rate is not exceeded.



less than 1 million barrels per day during the 1995-2003 period in 13 countries with a trend of declining oil production. The change over from growth to decline happens in a short time without much warning (few yellow colored columns representing a transitional phase of flat production).

In the last 3 years before the peak in 2000, production still increased by an average of 2.7% pa,

Latest update: 12/11/2004

Appendix 10.8 Saudi Arabia's Oil Reserves and Production



Aramco reports oil reserves constant almost to the decimal point over several years (left). Unless new discoveries exactly equal production (right), year by year, the reserve graph suggests these are total reserves ever found, not remaining reserves.



OPEC's internal quota war BP's Statistical Review data show a big jump (left, ca. 100 Gb) of Saudi reserves in the late 1980s which allowed higher production under a then newly introduced OPEC quota system. The IEA¹⁾ writes: "the hike ...was driven by negotiations over production quotas, and had little to do with actual discovery of new reserves. In fact, very little exploration activity was carried out at that time."

50 year crude scenarios (not forecasts) as presented by Aramco's Abdul Baqi (Vice president of exploration) and G.Saleri (Manager of reservoir engineering) before the Center for Strategic and International Studies (Washington) in Feb. 2004²). The left graph indicates **no intention to increase production beyond 10 million barrels/day** (currently at 9.5 mb/d). The scenario on the right would allow a maximum production of 12.5 mb/d from 2016 to 2033.



Apparently, the Saudis don't want to irreparably damage their fields by pushing them too hard. Compare this to the 22.5 mb/d for 2025 assumed in IEA's World Energy Outlook 2004. A 2.5 mb/d increase would not even cover China's present import requirement of 2.85 mb/d. 2) Source: (http://www.csis.org/energy/040224_bagiandsaleni.pdf)



Ain Dar/Shedgum Area / Arab D	means with his question. The EUR with 75% of
Resources Depletion State (1/1/2004)	oil in place is very high The depletion level
Contingent Resources: 26.9 Billion Barrels	would be: $40/(40+20+5) = 62\%$, not 40%.
17.1 Billion Barrels	produced 26.9 40%
10%	remaining
5% 20%	proved res.13.9 20%
* Possible: <u>6.8 Billion Barrels</u> 13 9 Billion Barrels	probable 3.4 5%
*Incremental.	possible 6.8 10%
OIIP: 68.1 Billion Barrels	contingent17.1 25%
Proved Reserves: 40.8 Billion Barrels (60% of OIIP) Estimated Ultimate Recovery: 51 Billion Barrels (75% of OIIP)	oil in place68.1100%
	The theoretical maximum of oil in place can
	never be produced fully. Only proved and
	probable reserves would be bankable.

Campbell summarizes: "On balance, the article does little to undermine ASPO's evaluation, which considers only what will be produced prior to a cutoff in 2075 to avoid having to worry about the largely irrelevant tail end of production. Its current assessment is that 97 Gb have been produced so far; that 144 Gb will come from known fields and 18 Gb from new discovery, giving a total of 260 Gb, the number claimed as remaining reserves. **The article does little to counter ASPO's current forecast that production will be flat to at least the midpoint of depletion in 2013. The depletion rate at that point would be about 2.3%, which is still relatively low, meaning that plateau production could be extended for some years longer before terminal decline need set in."**

³⁾ Source: <u>www.asponews.org</u> June 2004

Saudi Arabian oil discoveries and production as estimated by ASPO

In his latest publication, "The truth of oil", Eagle Print Ireland, Colin J. Campbell writes:

"Saudi Arabia granted a concession to a group of American companies in 1932, which led to the formal discovery of the World's largest field Ghawar in 1948, although it had been virtually identified before, the Second World War interrupted operations. It stands head and shoulders above all the other discoveries, giving the overall peak.

Its reserve data is unreliable, having been also subject to the OPEC quota wars in the late 1980s. The scope for future discovery is limited because the size of fields outside the prolific Ghawar-Safaniya trend is quite modest. Production may also collapse sooner than expected because the water table in Ghawar is rising with the injection of 7 Mb/d of salt water. Multi-branch horizontal wells are now being drilled to tap by-passed low permeability zones in the difficult reservoirs where faults and fractures provide anomalous paths for the injected water to reach the wells. The Saudis themselves give much higher estimates."



Saudi Arabia. 1/3 of fluid from the wells is already water. Source: Aram co^{2}



Source: ASPO

(1) UK's oil production peaked in 1999 (up, the dip is a result of the accident on the Alpha Piper platform), Norway's in 2002 (down). The total of the North Sea oil production has peaked.



(3) China has consumed 60% of its oil and has now reached a plateau in production. Demand for oil in 2004 is expected to be 6.3 mill. barrels/day of which only 3.45 mb/d can be supplied from Chinese oil fields.



In just 3years, Chinese imports have doubled from 1.4 mb/d to 2.85 mb/d. China's future demand growth as well as the replacement for declining local production has therefore to be fully supplied from the world oil market. Source: PFC Energy oil supply forecast 9/2004



(2) North American oil production (US 48 + Alaska + Mexico + Canada) is on a 10 year long plateau; US 48 States peaked in 1970/71; the 2nd, lower peak in the mid 80s was from Alaska which is now producing at only half of its peak capacity. Producing oil from the Arctic National Wildlife Refuge (estimated total of 10.7 Gb equivalent to 1.5 years US consumption) would be just another small hump on an otherwise ever declining US production curve.

Canadian tar sands will require huge amounts of natural gas (which is also short in supply) for processing. The gap between consumption and production is widening, requiring increasing imports. This cannot go on for very long.

Source of data: BP Statistical Review of World Energy 2004



(4) Depletion levels in various OPEC countries. Saudi oil production is entering the critical plateau phase (highlighted box between 42%-68%) which should be of great concern. The further advanced technology extends the plateau towards higher depletion levels, the steeper the decline at the end of the plateau. Iraq's depletion level is low due to reduced production in the last 20 years (war with Iran and UN sanctions). There are still 30%-40% geologically easy pre-peak Iraqi oil. Source: PFC Energy oil supply forecast 9/2004

PFC Energy Oil Supply Forecast; <u>www.csis.org/energy/040908_presentation.pdf</u> ASPO: Association for the Study of Peak Oil & Gas; <u>www.peakoil.net</u> and <u>www.asponews.org</u> IEA: International Energy Agency, Paris; <u>www.iea.org</u>; BP: <u>www.bp.com</u> Prepared by Matt Mushalik, last update 19/2/2005

ſ								
	(5) Mou	nting	evidenc	e has app	beared in the	8000		
	course of	f this	year tha	t some OF	PEC countries	6000		
	have bee	en rep	orting 1	total reserv	ves ever dis-	4000		
	covered	includ	ing pas	t productio	on instead of	2000		
	remaining	g rese	rves. H	ere are th	e differences	2000		
	between	BP an	d 3 esti	mates whe	ere deductions	0	<mark>┤┛╷┛╷┛╷┛╷╸╷┛╷┛</mark>	
	have been	n made	e using v	various met	hods (in Gb):	-2000	+	
	Country	PFC	ASPO	Salameh	BP			
	Iraq	99	62	62	115	-4000		
	UAE	42	49	37	98	-6000		
	Kuwait	59	60	71	97		978 980 982 984	
	Saudi	134	144	182	263	(\mathbf{O})		
	Nigeria	23	25	20	34	(0)	For coun	
	Iran	54	60	64	131	Cana	ada and NC	
	Venezuela	34	35	31	78	oil p	roduced an	
	Qatar	4.2	4.1	4.6	15	cons	ecutive ve	
	TOTAL	450	440	472	831	cons	umed only	
	This means there could be around 350 Gb less Source PEC Ener							
	oil than guoted by BP equal to 12 years world							
	oil consumption or 32 years OPEC supply at (7) There are							
	current levels. This would destroy the myth of remaining rese							

oil consumption or 32 years OPEC supply at current levels! This would destroy the myth of decades of cheap and plentiful oil supply from the Middle East.

http://www.asponews.org/docs/newsletter46.pdf



(8) An alarming 71% of the world's annual oil production is from countries with either stagnating or declining production. (BP data).



(6) For countries excluding Opec, FSU, Canada and NGLs, the annual balance between oil produced and discovered is negative for 16 consecutive years now. For every 4 liter consumed, only 1 liter is newly discovered. Source: PFC Energy oil supply forecast 9/2004

(7) There are big question marks over the remaining reserves in Saudi Arabia's super giant oil field Ghawar, which started producing in 1948 and still contributes 5 mill barrels/day (=6% of world production). In 1975, Chevron reported 48 Gb as remaining reserves, but these were conservative estimates and ASPO rather assumes 80 Gb. By 2003, 53 Gb were produced, leaving 27 Gb and resulting in a depletion level of 65% - while Aramco claims it is 48%. Reservoir pressure in Ghawar can only be maintained by massive injection of (corrosive) saltwater. Total liquid produced already contains more than 30% water.

In any event, the IEA's monthly oil market report confirms that Saudi production growth in new projects can just offset decline in older fields (600-800 kb/d). Some analysts calculate that Saudi production will peak at 9.6 mb/d by end of 2004 and then decline to 8 mb/d by end 2007.



We usually divide remaining reserves by our annual production and think there are around 40 years of oil left. But we cannot simply distribute reserves evenly over any period of time to suit our current consumption. Oil geology does not work this way. Oil production always goes through a life cycle of growth, peak and decline. Future oil production must be properly computer simulated taking into account technical reserve data and current depletion levels (up, right, as done by ASPO). The critical event in oil history is the peaking of production, not the ultimate "running out of oil" which may happen in 70-80 years or even later.

Appendix 16: Analysis of International Energy Agency's WEO 2004 Table 3.5 Focus: OPEC's overstated reserves

Table 3.5: World O	il Suppl	ly (millior	barrels p	er day)		World Energy Outlook's table 3.5 (lef
	2002	2010	2020	2030	2002- 2030*	which is being displayed as a graph on t
Non-OPEC	45.3	51.3	47.9	43.4	-0.2	ilext page, shows clearly that all growth
OECD Total	21.1	20.1	16.3	12.7	-1.8	oil supplies comes from OPEC, with t
DECD North America	13.7	14.8	12.6	10.0	-1.1	exception of non-conventional oil, whi
United States and Canada	10.1	10.6	8.7	7.2	-1.2	contributes only modestly by compariso
DECD Europe	5.0	4.2	4.0	2.8	-0.9	The table implies that OPEC produc
OECD Pacific	0.8	0.5	0.5	0.5	-2.0	around 460 Gb in the period $2002 - 203$
Transition economies	9.5	14.6	15.4	15.9	1.8	a whopping 50% increase over curre
Russia Other transition economies	1.9	10.4 4.2	10.6 4.7	10.8 5.2	1.2 3.7	performance levels.
Developing countries	14.6	16.6	16.2	14.8	0.0	
uhina India	3.4	3.3	2.7	2.2	-1.5	This is despite the fact that the IEA h
Drher Asia	1.7	1.6	1.2	0.5	-1.0	for the first time, calculated that OPI
Latin America	3.7	4.7	5.5	6.1	1.8	added unexplainable reserves of 76
Brazil	1.5	2.5	3.3	4.0	3.6	529-229 Ch between 1095 and 1000 a
Other Latin America	2.2	2.2	2.2	2.1	-0.2	538=228 GD between 1985 and 1990 a
Africa	3.0	4.6	4.9	4.4	1.4	that several OPEC countries have peak
Middle East	2.1	1.8	1.4	1.0	-2./	or are already in decline.
OPEC Middle Even	28.2	33.3	49.8	64.8	3.0	
Other OPEC	9.2	10.7	12.4	13.0	1.2	However, the IEA fails to reduce the
Non-conventional ail	1.6	3.8	65	10.1	67	reserve data by that amount and rel
of which GTL	0.0	0.4	1.5	2.4	16.0	instead on the same USCS based to
Processing gains	1.8	2.0	2.5	3.0	1.9	instead on the same USGS based tai
World	77.0	90.4	106.7	121.3	1.6	already used in the WEO 2001 (2.5
	7710	,	1001/	121.5	1.0	2001, now table 3.3), not changed by
orth America 47 urope 19 ussia 30	:	50 14 38	41 10 39		138 43 107	translates into a total of 1050 Gb (left) f a period of 29 years.
PEC 101		152	20	9	462	
on Conventional 9		19	30		58	This is equal to the total reserve figu
rocess. Gains 6		8	10		24	given by RP in 2003 and more th
otal		•			1050	given by DI in 2005 and more in
					1000	what the world has consumed in t
						last century!
Table 2.5: USGS Estim	ates of (billio	Global (n barrels)	Dil and N	NGL Res	ources	Table 3.3: USGS Estimates of Ultimately Recoverable Oil and NGL Resource (billion barrels)
		01		01*		Category/probability* 95% 50% 5% Mean
		Oil	N	GL*	Total	Undiscovered 495 881 1589 939
Undiscovered recoverable resou	rces	732	2	207	939	Reserves growth 229 /30 1 230 /30
Mean reserve growth		688		42	730	Remaining reserves 95
Mean remaining receives		801		68	959	Cumulative production 71
Cumulating reserves		710		7	777	Total ultimately recoverable resources 3 34
Cumulative production		/10		24	/1/ 2.245	Remaining ultimately recoverable resources 2 620
*NGL volumes for the US are included in	s the oil fig	3,021) 	024	3,343	* Per cent chance of there being at least the amount indicated. Source: USGS (2000). Data are as of 1 January 1996 and for those parts of the world actually assessed.
Source: USGS (2000).	iction data	renect only	nose parts of	the world ac	assessed	World Energy Outlook 2004 Table 3
Iorld Energy Outle	ol '	2001	Table	25	Nota	that unchanged despite overstated OP
one of the resources	wou	<u>lld</u> be	of lov	2.5. ver qu	ality.	reserves.
• Resources: A	ll oil	theor	etical	ly tho	ught to	be present in an area (oil geologist's opinio
Costs of acces	sing	resou	rces a	re unk	nown	Bankers will not loan money on resources.

Reserves: Oil that has been discovered and is expected to be economically producible (oil • engineer's conservative opinion). Bankers will loan money on reserves.



The same method seems to have been used in WEO 2004 again. Table 3.5 entered in a spreadsheet and displayed using the graphics tool (up) clearly shows growing OPEC production against a flat or slightly decreasing rest production. Therefore:

But can OPEC really deliver 460 Gb in the next 3 decades? During the last 10 years, OPEC achieved approximately 11 Gb per annum, which would be 320 Gb in 29 years. The growth element in the above graph is 235Gb>228Gb which IEA mentions is OPEC's overstated reserve figure. In other words:

The above formula (=swing role) may have worked in the past, but as several OPEC countries are approaching a plateau in production, this should no longer be taken for granted.



Figure 3.20 in WEO 2004 showing future production as in the previous graph on page 2 but here detailing different types of oil categories. The peak in 2033 is not shown.

Oil supplies in Gb 2002 to 2030 New discoveries 90 Non-conventional oil 60 Enhanced oil recoveries 120 Development of existing reserves 370 Existing capacities 410 Total 1050

The numbers in the above table represent the areas in the graph of figure 3.20 (left). It is surprising that less than 10% is from new discoveries.

The graph shows:

- Production from existing capacities rapidly declines between 3 and 5 % pa from 75 mb/d in 2003 to just 15 mb/d in 2030 meaning that ever increasing amounts of oil would have to come from new capacities just to hold the status quo.
- (2) Existing capacities and existing reserves would peak around 2010, and then decline at 1-2% pa. Note that OPEC's overstated reserves have not been deducted.
- (3) Therefore, growth would only come from enhanced oil recovery, non-conventional oil and new discoveries. These new discoveries alone (25 mb/d in 2030) would require to develop 4 new oil provinces the size of the North Sea (peak production 6 mb/d)

Prof. Aleklett from Uppsala University has prepared a 17 page long commentary on WEO 2004 entitled "IEA accepts peak oil". He says one needs to decode the hidden messages in some of IEA's statements:

- "Production of conventional oil will not peak before 2030 if the necessary investments are made"
- But the "peak of production would come by 2015 or before if the USGS mean estimate should prove too high"

Other main points made in ASPO's critique are:

- The IEA's political agenda does not allow oil production to decline
- There is a steady trend of falling annual oil discovery rates since the 1960s
- Drilling more will not substantially yield much higher reserves as shown in creaming curves
- OPEC's spurious reserve additions in the 1980s have been acknowledged by the IEA
- The IEA fails to draw conclusions from the above and turns to the flawed USGS 2000 study by adopting their mean estimate which is much higher than the consensus of 65 studies over the last 30-40 years
- Reserve growth, assumed by the IEA to be one of the most important providers of additional oil, will affect production mainly after peak oil
- Russia's oil exports have been over-estimated
- The IEA did not consult the (expensive) Industry Database held by IHS
- Saudi Arabia's publicly declared intention to limit production to 12 mb/d as a maximum sustainable capacity will not allow OPEC production to grow as IEA assumes

For more details, see Prof. Aleklett's analysis of chapter 3 at <u>www.peakoil.net</u>

The overstated OPEC reserves have another effect on the USGS 2000 mean estimate: the reserve growth element would also have to be reduced.

The USGS 2000 team had, compared to its 1994 estimate, added a new category of oil called **'reserve growth'**. This is a reserve reporting phenomenon found in America where early, conservative estimates ("proved reserves") according to SEC rules were later consecutively revised upwards as reserve categories "probable" and "possible" were developed and produced. Only 6% of US reserve additions over the past 20 years came from new discoveries. The growth factor based on US experience was found to be 44%. This percentage was then applied to the known fields of the rest of the world, though reserve reporting is different there.



The USGS 1994 estimate by C.D. Masters had rejected the idea of such a reserve growth for the rest of the world by noting that many other countries, in particular all OPEC countries, the former Sowjet Union, China and Mexico are reporting proved + probable + possible reserves thereby already including future reserve growth. The amount in question is huge: 612 Gb equal to 20 years of current global oil production. According to the USGS 2000 team itself. these reserves are "preliminary" and "hypothetical", requiring further research, which has not been done yet.

Example of an unreliable USGS reserve growth calculation						
Ain Dar/Shedgum Area / Arab D Resources Depletion State (1/1/2004) Produced: 26.9 Billion Barrels 25 40% * Possible: 8.8 Billion Barrels * Incomental * Incomental DIIP: 68.1 Billion Barrels Proved Reserves: 40.8 Billion Barrels (60% of OIIP) Estimated Ultimate Recovery: 51 Billion Barrels (75% of OIIP)	Let's have a look at this Saudi oil field (left). oil categoryGb produced 26.9 40% remaining proved res.13.9 20% probable 3.4 5% possible 6.8 10% contingent17.1 25% oil in place68.1100% The actual reserve growth would be 'probable' + 'possible': 3.4 + 6.8 =10.2 Gb or 10.2/(26.9+13.9)=25%					
	of past production and remaining reserves.					

Using the USGS method, the calculation would be: (26.9+13.9) x .44=18 Gb or 80% more than actually available. Since the OPEC reserve reporting is not clear, there are 2 more possibilities:

(a) If the Saudis include 'probable' and 'possible' in their published reserves , the USGS reserve growth calculation would be: $51 \times .44 = 22$ Gb

(b) If the Saudis report total reserves ever found instead of remaining reserves, the USGS formula would yield: $(40.8+26.9) \times .44 = 30$ Gb.

This means that the USGS mean estimate of reserve growth may be up to 3 times the physically available oil. Why would any bank accept these speculative figures as a basis for multi billion dollar decisions in oil dependent infrastructure? Source of graph: www.csis.org/energy/040224_baqiandsaleni.pdf