

12 February 2006

Heritage Inquiry
Productivity Commission
P O Box 80
BELCONNEN ACT 2616

**PRODUCTIVITY COMMISSION DRAFT REPORT ON CONSERVATION OF
AUSTRALIA'S HISTORIC HERITAGE PLACES**

In support of our submission (25.01.06) and our appearance at the Productivity Commission in Sydney (31.01.06) at which;

1. we identified the “*the main pressures on the conservation of historic heritage places*” as being the NSW State Government’s urban consolidation policies and the NSW State Government’s blocking of gazettal of Urban Conservation Areas as compounding the problem, and
2. we submitted the need for stronger wording on Draft Recommendation 9.8, which states: *State and Territory governments should remove the identification and management of heritage, zones, precincts or similar areas from their heritage conservation legislation and regulation, leaving these matters to local government planning schemes.*

please find:

IMAGES

- **Image** of “The Oaks” 517 Pacific Highway, Killara and accompanying text. As a consequence of the State Governments urban consolidation polices an application was lodged to demolish this fine Edwardian classic. “The Oaks” stands at the entrance to the Killara UCA. The State Government denies gazettal process of UCAS.* **Attach A**
- **Images** and captions of 25 Tryon Rd Lindfield “Before” & “After” **Attach B**
- **Images** and captions of Pacific Highway cnr Marshall Ave Warrawee, “Before” & “After” **Attach B**
- **Images** and captions from Sydney Observer **Attach C**

BRIEF HISTORY

In submitting this brief history, and for the purposes of the Productivity Commission, we note that Ku-ring-gai is not alone in being prevented by the State Government from gazetting of UCA's.

* URBAN CONSERVATION AREAS IN KU-RING-GAI.

In 1996 The National Trust of Australia (NSW) completed their *Interwar Housing Study* and identified 28 precincts in Ku-ring-gai of sufficient integrity and significance to become Urban Conservation Areas. The precincts are along the railway corridor. Ku-ring-gai has more Urban Conservation Areas than any other Local Government Area in NSW.

Ku-ring-gai Council examines the National Trust proposed UCAs. In 2002 an *Urban Conservation Area Draft Report* is produced by heritage experts Godden Mackay Logan recommending that a number of UCA's be formalised. Ku-ring-gai has a high level of heritage significance with 700 listed heritage items and about 400 other proposed/potential heritage items.

The State Government refuses to permit Council to put these UCA's on public exhibition until after Ku-ring-gai's Residential Development Strategy (RDS) is accepted. However, the studies are exhibited to residents.

RDS is modified by Government then accepted and gazetted early 2004.

In October 2004 State Government denies several Councils permission to proceed with UCA's as the Government considers that to do so would be inappropriate to its Urban Consolidation policy. Negotiations continue with the Government to find a solution recognising both the heritage significance of Ku-ring-gai and Ku-ring-gai Council's extensive RDS preparation.

Late 2004, DAs flood into Council and the destruction of Ku-ring-gai's heritage begins.

In relation to Ku-ring-gai, the Commission will recall that both in our submission and at the hearing we drew attention to:

- The Australian Council of National Trusts listing of Ku-ring-gai's 28 National Trust Urban Conservation areas on the ACNT 2000 Endangered Places list which stated: "*State Government medium density policies actually promote (this) destruction and unless they are modified, local development controls strengthened and a residential strategy based on heritage principles is adopted, the garden suburbs of Ku-ring-gai remain under threat.*" (Our emphasis); and
- The nomination of Ku-ring-gai as an Endangered Place received the NSW Heritage Office Cultural Heritage Award in the 2000 Keep Australia Beautiful Council (NSW) Awards program. The nomination project was called "Heritage Watch Over Our Place of National Significance – Ku-ring-gai.

In conclusion, we note that other parties at the Sydney hearing also raised the *main pressures on the conservation of heritage places* as arising from the NSW State Government's urban consolidation policies and the NSW State Government's blocking of gazettal of Urban Conservation Areas as compounding the problem.

We thank you for this opportunity to make further comment. Yours sincerely

Anne Carroll OAM

Dip Phys

Enclosures:

Janine Kitson

BA, Dip Ed, M Ed, Dip TEFL, MA, M Ed (Hons)

A Ku-ring-gai Landmark
On the corner of Stanhope Road and Pacific Highway, Killara
(517 Pacific Highway, Killara)



The Oaks “A heritage classic in Killara” Photograph & text NORTH SHORE TIMES Friday July 6 2001 p 65. “It is an Edwardian classic with period features throughout, open fireplaces, joinery, sandstone features and picture rails...There is an impressive entrance foyer with marble pillars and a grand staircase.”

DESTRUCTION OF NSW'S HERITAGE

BEFORE - URBAN CONSERVATION AREA SITE SEIZED BY NSW GOVERNMENT



Above: Lost/Demolished heritage item, 25 Tryon Road, Lindfield, a rare Arts and Crafts home located within Ku-ring-gai's National Trust Urban Conservation Area (UCA) 6 listed as an Endangered Place by the Australian Council of National Trusts in 2000.

AFTER



Above: Replaced by 5-storey development. The development is alien to the surrounding single and two storey Federation homes/units within the Urban Conservation Area.

BEFORE

URBAN CONSERVATION AREA SITE SEIZED BY NSW GOVERNMENT



Above: Lost/Demolished heritage item 'Wivenhoe', corner Pacific Highway and Marshall Avenue, Warrawee located in UCA 26 listed as an Endangered Place by the Australian Council of National Trusts in 2000.

AFTER -



Above: Replaced by 5-6 storey development which dominates its single storey domestic dwelling neighbours, valued Ku-ring-gai treed context and an adjacent two storey commercial building.

DESTRUCTION OF NSW'S HERITAGE

We identified the “*the main pressures on the conservation of historic heritage places*” as being the NSW State Government’s urban consolidation policies and the NSW State Government’s blocking of gazettal of Urban Conservation Areas as compounding the problem.

From Sydney Observer May 2005



Both sites lie in National Trust UCAs.

Left: Page 10 of Sydney Observer May 2005. “Residents of Marian St Killara hired a cherry picker in order to show Ku-ring-gai Council’s site inspection team just how high 21 metres is.”

Right: Front cover of Sydney Observer May 2005 shows demolition in progress at 9-25 Tryon Rd Lindfield