

Scanned submission of
original submission

John Boyd
St. Ives NSW 2075

26/02/06

To the Commissioners, Productivity Inquiry into Heritage Dear

Sirs,

Re Ms. Zeny Edwards' Submission to the Heritage Enquiry of 23^d January 2006

With regard to Ms. Edwards' submission, it seems desirable that the following facts be placed on record at this time:

(1) Ms. Edwards states that Mr. Rahmani's currently unlisted house at No. 27 Richmond Avenue "has just been purchased by a young family who are quite happy for the property to be listed and are benefiting from the advice and help of the NSW Heritage Office with plans for extensions to the house". This is simply not so. The prospective purchasers decided not to proceed, and Mr. Rahmani is still unable to sell his home because of the threat of possible heritage listing in the future.

(2) Ms. Edwards further states that: "Other owners of the Pettit and Sevitt houses in the groupnow do not want to be involved in Mr. Boyd's active campaign against heritage listing." Again, this is not so. Several have supported Mr. Rahmani and myself in our attempts to persuade Council not to heritage list our homes, and continue to support us. All, with the exception of the owners of No. 29 Richmond Avenue, have written to Council requesting that it rescind the LEP listing for those Pettit and Sevitt homes already listed (copy attached).

(3) Ms. Edwards surmises that: "the loss of value of \$120,000 on the value of Mr. Boyd's property is perhaps one quote from a real estate developer who was eager to get his custom". Again, not so. In fact we engaged the services of a fully qualified property surveyor at a cost of \$700. His valuation put the value without heritage listing at \$720,000, and with heritage listing at \$600,000, a reduction of \$120,000 (copy attached).

Once again, thank you for the opportunity to participate in this inquiry.

Yours faithfully

John Boyd.

14 April 2005

ATTN: Mr Brian Bell General Manager
CC: Mayor Adrienne Ryan & Counsellor Tony Hall
Ku-Ring-Gai Council
Locked Bag 1056
Pymble NSW 2073

Dear Mr Bell,

**Re: Request to NOT Gazette 23 Richmond Avenue, St Ives
Under Ku-Ring-Gai Council's LEP
And to Rescind or De-List:
17,19, 21 & 25 Richmond Avenue, St Ives from LEP**

We the undersigned, respectfully request that Ku-Ring-Gai Council not go ahead with the gazetting of 23 Richmond Avenue and rescind the LEP listing for 17, 19, 21, and 25 Richmond Avenue, St Ives for the following reasons:

1. On 2 June 2004, The Heritage Council of NSW in accordance with Section 33(1)(e) of the Heritage Act 1977 made a recommendation to the Minister to not list the Pettit & Sevitt Exhibition Centre No 1 Precinct (Richmond Avenue, St Ives) on the State Heritage Register. This decision followed the site visits and presentations by the owners/objectors and was based on the inability for the Heritage Council to "reach any definitive conclusion that the group is of State Heritage significance".
2. On 5 April 2005, Ku-Ring-Gai Council decided in the light of the above NSW heritage Council's decision not to list these properties on the State Heritage Register, that the Local Heritage listings of 27 Richmond Avenue and 400 Mona Vale Road be discontinued (DLEP29).
3. Given the considerable costs to Ku-Ring-Gai Council in the preparation, exhibition and resolution of DLEP29 and the defence of the Class 1 Appeal 10721 of 2004 to refuse DA795/02 for 27 Richmond Avenue St Ives, we request that due to the above decisions that Council decides to conserve its financial resources by not defending the continuation of the current local LEP listing for the remaining properties.
4. As 23 Richmond Avenue St Ives has not been formally gazetted on the local LEP listing we request that this draft LEP does not go ahead for the same reasons as points 1 & 2.

In summary, we believe that Ku-Ring-Gai LEP 1989 (No.'s 17,19,21 & 25) be rescinded or de-listed and ask that Council advises those owners below

the process that will be taken to eliminate what we believe to be an inappropriate and unnecessary Local Heritage Listing.

The above letter has been approved and signed as follows:

PROPERTY	OWNERS	SIGNATURE 1	SIGNATURE 2
400 Mona Vale Rd	Mr John Boyd & Mrs Jan Boyd		
17 Richmond Ave	Mr L & Mrs S Lockyer		
19 Richmond Ave	Mrs Galina Shein		
21 Richmond Ave	Mr H & Mrs S Salahifar		
23 Richmond Ave	Mr R Hubba & Ms S Totman		
25 Richmond Ave	Mr A & Mrs G Wolman		
27 Richmond Ave	Mr S Rahmani Av		

[Signatures supplied]

REPORT

LOCATION

The subject property is located on the western side of Mona Vale Road at the intersection with Richmond Avenue (north western corner) at St Ives, an established residential area approx. 23 kilometres north of the City of Sydney CBD. This can be considered a good location in close proximity to most services, facilities and amenities.

TITLE

Lot 11
Deposited Plan (DP) 220538 at
St Ives
Local Government Area of Ku-ring-gai
Parish of Gordon. County of Cumberland.

The current owners are noted as being John Harold Boyd in 2/3 share and Janet Wedge in 1/3 share as tenants in common.

SERVICES

Electricity, Town Water, Sewerage, Drainage and Telephone are all available to the property. Streets in the area are bitumen-scaled thoroughfares with concrete kerb & gutter.

THE LAND

The land is a fan shaped parcel on the western side of Mona Vale Road at the intersection of Richmond Avenue (north western corner), with a gentle rise from the Richmond Avenue frontage to a level building platform on a total area given as 904.2 square metres.

Vehicular access is gained via the Richmond Avenue frontage.

ZONING

We understand that the property has a Residential zoning 2(c) under the Ku-ring gai Local Environmental Plan. The present use appears to be a compliant use.

IMPROVEMENTS

The improvements comprise a single level brick veneer residence constructed on concrete footings, erected in 1964 with further renovations/extension in 1974_ with a metal deck roof supported on a timber frame:

The approximate floor area of the dwelling was measured at: Internal

Living Area	160 square metres
Single carport/tool shed	23 square metres
Covered courtyard	13 square metres
Total Area:	196 square metres

Accommodation provided includes

- a front entry and service hallways;
- a main lounge / living room;
- a family room;
- a study;
- a kitchen with laminate benches over timber cupboards. 4-plate electric cooktop, rangehood, oven under cooktop, dishwasher and double stainless steel sink;
- a master bedroom with built-in wardrobe;
- an en-suite bathroom with shower recess, pedestal basin and LDS;
- three additional bedrooms, all with built-in wardrobes;
- a study,
- a main bathroom with bathtub, shower recess. single vanity & LDS;
- a laundry with single plastic wash tub & built-in cupboard leading to a separate bathroom with shower recess, single vanity & LDS;
- a single car port with attached tool shed and covered rear courtyard: and
- in ground concrete pool with spa.

Inclusions comprise floor coverings of carpet and tiles: light fittings; timber window and door treatments. security system: deadlocks and air-conditioning. Additional improvements comprise storage room, concrete/paved paths and driveway and perimeter fencing.

STATE OF REPAIR

As we are neither builders nor engineers.. we can make no claims concerning the structural state of the premises and recommend that a building inspection report and pest certificate be commissioned from suitably qualified professionals to determine the exact structural state of the property. This valuation is dependant upon a satisfactory report.

Overall we found the subject residence to be in a good state of repair and condition throughout. The yard has been well maintained and extensively landscaped.

GENERAL

The subject consists of a parcel of land in a popular residential area, close to most services, facilities and amenities. The improvements comprise a single level brick residence constructed on solid footings, initially erected in 1964 and extended in 1974, with metal decking over a timber frame roof.

The property is subject to some road noise from Mona Vale Road. The property has been well maintained and presents well commensurate with its age.

We understand that Ku-ring-gai Council has mooted the property for possible heritage listing.

Prices for the area have improved noticeably over the past few years. However, two interest rate increases, with further increases predicted have resulted in a decline in demand and sales volume since late 2003.

METHOD OF VALUATION

Consideration has been given to the location and position. and the age. size, and particularly the condition and state of presentation of the subject: the sale and analysis of similar and/or comparable property in the area: the Summation Method: and the current real estate market.

Our prime method of valuation is the Adjusted Direct Comparable Analysis method, which compares the subject with other residences that have sold in the area in recent times, after making appropriate adjustments taking into consideration factors such as

1. variations in the location and position of the properties;
2. variations in the size, quality, topography, slope. etc. of the land;
3. variations and differences in the scope, range, direction and quality of any views available or possible from the properties:
the size, nature, quality, age, state of repair, condition and presentation of any improvements on the land;
5. inherent positive and negative features and characteristics of the properties;
6. current permissible uses and future potential uses of the land; and
7. other factors considered of relevance.

Of the sales that occurred in the area during 2004, we found the following of the most assistance to our assessment of the "as is" value:

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sold</u>	<u>Prices</u>	<u>Compamhility</u>
14 Horace Street, St Ives Inferior improvement	July 04	\$615,000	Inferior
281 Mona Vale Rd, St Ives Larger Home, larger land	Jan 04	\$910,000	Superior
48 Killeaton St. St Ives Smaller Land	Aprl 04	\$721,000	Comparable
16 Horace Street. St Ives Inferior improvement	July 04	\$650.000	Inferior

Of the sales that occurred in the area during 2003-2004, we found the following of the most assistance to our assessment of the value as a heritage listed property:

<u>Address</u>	<u>Sold</u>	<u>Price</u>	<u>Comparability</u>
21 Richmond Ave, St Ives Larger Home. Quite location.	Oct 03	\$712,000	Superior
42 Mona Vale Rd. Pymble Larger Home. Larger land	July 03	\$670,000	Superior
83 Coonanbarra Rd, Wahroonga Quality Federation house	Aprl 04	\$1,400,000	Superior

Based on our overall analysis of the available heritage sales and market evidence.. we assess the figures shown in the following Certificate of Value

DATE OF VALUATION

October 13, 2004.

CERTIFICATE OF VALUE

I am of the opinion that, subject to the qualifications and recommendations contained within the body of this report, the Fair Market Value of the subject property, as at the date of valuation_ would be

"As is":

\$720,000
(Seven Hundred and Twenty Thousand Dollars)

As a heritage listed property:

\$600,000
(Six Hundred Thousand Dollars)

Anthony Zantiotis
Registered Valuer
NSW Registration No. 3 881.