© Commonwealth of Australia 2013

ISBN  978-1-74037-433-0

This work is copyright. Apart from any use as permitted under the Copyright Act 1968, the work may be reproduced in whole or in part for study or training purposes, subject to the inclusion of an acknowledgment of the source. Reproduction for commercial use or sale requires prior written permission from the Productivity Commission. Requests and inquiries concerning reproduction and rights should be addressed to Media and Publications (see below).

This publication is available from the Productivity Commission website at www.pc.gov.au. If you require part or all of this publication in a different format, please contact Media and Publications.

Publications Inquiries:
Media and Publications
Productivity Commission
Locked Bag 2 Collins Street East
Melbourne    VIC    8003
Tel: (03) 9653 2244
Fax: (03) 9653 2303
Email: maps@pc.gov.au

General Inquiries:
Tel: (03) 9653 2100 or (02) 6240 3200

An appropriate citation for this paper is:

The Productivity Commission

The Productivity Commission is the Australian Government’s independent research and advisory body on a range of economic, social and environmental issues affecting the welfare of Australians. Its role, expressed most simply, is to help governments make better policies, in the long term interest of the Australian community.

The Commission’s independence is underpinned by an Act of Parliament. Its processes and outputs are open to public scrutiny and are driven by concern for the wellbeing of the community as a whole.

Further information on the Productivity Commission can be obtained from the Commission’s website (www.pc.gov.au) or by contacting Media and Publications on (03) 9653 2244 or email: maps@pc.gov.au
Foreword


As secretariat for the Review of Government Services, under the Council of Australian Governments (COAG), the Productivity Commission is responsible for the development and publication of the regular Overcoming Indigenous Disadvantage report. The report has demonstrated that, despite several decades of good policy intentions and effort, there remain unacceptable disparities between outcomes for Indigenous and other Australians.

As noted at the roundtable by Gary Banks, then chairman of the Productivity Commission, ‘it is said that the greatest tragedy of failure is failing to learn from it. But that seems to be the predominant history of Indigenous policies and programs’. Yet the situation is not hopeless; the roundtable discussed several examples of good practice in evaluation of Indigenous programs, from both Australia and overseas.

Our aspiration for this roundtable was to identify principles and practices to guide the better use of evaluation in Indigenous policy in the future — so that more high-quality evaluations will be undertaken and the evidence gained from them will drive policy improvements that benefit Indigenous people and the wider community. While we found genuine, broadly based support for better processes and outcomes, and confidence that we do know at least some of the key problems and potential responses, there was general agreement that an overarching policy review was required to address fundamental issues of ‘government governance’: the way governments work with, and in, Indigenous communities.

Mike Woods
Deputy Chairman

April 2013
Contents

Foreword iii

Summary of roundtable discussions 1

Session 1  Introduction
1  Introduction— why this roundtable? 17  Gary Banks
2  Outcomes for Indigenous Australians — the current situation 21  Robert Fitzgerald
3  The Indigenous policy experience 1960 to 2012 51  Fred Chaney

Session 2  The challenges in evaluating social and Indigenous policy
4  Challenges in evaluating Indigenous policy 69  Les Malezer
5  The case for making public policy evaluations public 81  Deborah A Cobb-Clark

Dinner address
6  Holding governments to account 93  Jody Broun

Session 3  Key themes in evaluation of Indigenous policy and programs
7  Designing evaluation strategies 107  Matthew James
8  Data for better Indigenous policy evaluation: achievements, constraints and opportunities 119  John Taylor
9  Evaluating Indigenous programs and policies: communicating the outcomes 131  David Kalisch and Fadwa Al-Yaman
Session 4   International experience

10 Better Indigenous policies: an Aotearoa New Zealand perspective on the role of evaluation
   Helen Moewaka Barnes
   155

   Frances Abele
   183

Session 5   Evaluation and policy

12 The use of evaluation in Indigenous policy and program development: the case of Stronger Futures in the Northern Territory
   Michael Dillon
   227

13 Learning from experience? Getting governments to listen to what evaluations are telling them
   Prue Phillips-Brown, Tim Reddel and Brian Gleeson
   245

Appendixes

A Roundtable program
   267

B Roundtable participants
   271